

**STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION  
SPECIAL HEARING ON LNG  
OPEN SESSION MINUTES  
PERFORMING ARTS AND CONVENTION CENTER  
800 HOBSON WAY  
OXNARD, CALIFORNIA**

**10:00 AM**

**April 9, 2007**

**APPEARANCES**

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT**

John Garamendi, Lt. Governor, Chair  
John Chiang, Controller  
Anne Sheehan, Alternate for Department of Finance

**COMMISSIONER'S STAFF PRESENT**

Brian Bugsch, Alternate for Lt. Governor  
Cindy Aronberg, Alternate for Controller

**STAFF MEMBERS IN ATTENDANCE**

Paul D. Thayer, Executive Officer  
Jack Rump, Chief Counsel  
Dwight Sanders, Chief,  
Mark Meier, Senior Staff Counsel  
Barbara Dugal, Chief, Land Management Division  
Mary Hays, Land Management Division

**REPRESENTING THE OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL**

Alan Hager, Supervising Deputy Attorney General  
Danae Aitchison, Deputy Attorney General  
Marion Moe, Deputy Attorney General

**RECORD OF ACTION TAKEN BY THE  
CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION  
MEETING OF APRIL 9, 2007**

State Controller John Chiang, Acting Chair, called the special meeting of the California State Lands Commission to order at 10:20 a.m. at the Oxnard Performing Arts and Convention Center.

The minutes of the March 30, 2007 teleconference meeting were approved by a vote of 2-0.

The recommendation of staff, relative to Calendar Item C01, was approved by unanimous vote of Commission Chair John Garamendi, John Chiang and Anne Sheehan.

**Regular Item 02:** The Commission listened to staff reports from various state and federal agencies and BHP Billiton. After hearing testimony from elected officials and concerned citizens the Commission voted on the item as follows:

The State Lands Commission, by a 2-1 vote, voted to not certify the final Environmental Impact Report and to deny a lease for the BHP Liquified Natural Gas terminal proposed off Oxnard/Malibu.

The meeting was adjourned by Lieutenant Governor John Garamendi at 10:19 p.m.

**PUBLIC ADDRESSING THE LNG ITEM  
CALIFORNIA STATE LANDS COMMISSION MEETING**

**APRIL 9, 2007**

**REGULAR CALENDAR ITEM 02 – BHP BILLITON LNG PROJECT**

- Sarah Abramson, Staff Scientist, Heal the Bay
- Nathan Alley, Attorney, Environmental Defense Center on behalf of CCPN
- Lupe Anguiano, representing self
  
- Russ Baggerly, representing self
- Richard Baldwin, Air Quality Consultant, BHP
- Steve Bennett, Ventura County Board of Supervisors
- R. Cameron Benson, Executive Director, EDC on behalf of CCPN
- Luz Bernardino, Community Leader, Centro *Mujer* (?)
- Paul Betouliere, representing self
- Gordon Birr, Director, Beacon Foundation
- Janet Bridges, Executive Director, Earth Alert
- Keely Brosnan, Environmental Reporter, representing self
- Pierce Brosnan, Environmental Activist, representing Jean Michel Cousteau
- Julia Browney, Assemblymember
- Barbara Burnett
  
- Linda Gray Calderon, representing self
- Andy Caldwell, Executive Director, COLAB
- Lois Capps, Congresswoman
- Danny Carrilo, Worksite Organizer, SEIU 721
- Edward M. Castillo, representing self
- Anthony Chavez, representing self
- Maureen Christopher, Hospice Chaplain
- Chris Coudert, Retired Government Teacher
- Rory Cox, Pacific Environment

## **PUBLIC ADDRESSING THE LNG ITEM - CONTINUED**

- Dr. Bonnie Dean, Doctor of Chiropractic, representing self
- Dr. Alessandra DeClario, representing self
- Mike DeMartino, representing self
- Wayne Dey, Engineer, representing self
- Mary Dodd, retired teacher
  
- Lauraine Effress, representing self
- Conner Everts, Surfrider Foundation
  
- Don Facciano, President, Ventura County Taxpayers Association
- Erica Fernandez, Student, Hueneme High School
- Steve Fleischer, representing Wilson neighborhood
- Robert Fletcher, California Air Resources Board
- Mark Flores, Airsheet Innovation R&D LLC
- John K. Flynn, Supervisor, Ventura County
- Timothy Flynn, Councilmember, City of Oxnard
- David Follin, representing self
  
- Alez Garcia, representing self
- Hilda Garcia, representing Senator Sheila Kuehl
- Frank Gavaller, retired SoCal Gas, representing self
- Ed Gillespie, President, Malibu Chamber of Commerce
- Dr. Mortimer Glasgal, representing self
- Larry Godwin, representing self
- Shirley Godwin, representing self
- Pete Gooding, Lt. Commander, U.S. Coast Guard
- David Gottlieb, Director, Resource Conservation District of the Santa Monica Mountains
  
- Barry Haldeman, Attorney
- Bob Handy, representing self
- Jean Harris, Saviers Road Design Team
- Jeff Harris, Physician
- David Harvey, representing self
- Ellen Bougher Harvey, Teacher
- John C. Hazeltine, representing self
- Peter Hearst, representing self
- Richard Heede, Principal, Climate Mitigation Services

## **PUBLIC ADDRESSING THE LNG ITEM - CONTINUED**

- Jim Hensley, President, Greater Oxnard Organization of Democrats
- Kraig Hill, Independent Consultant
- Jim Hoagland, representing self
- Michelle Hoffman, representing self
- Dr. Tom Holden, Mayor, City of Oxnard
- Laura Holtz, representing self
- Jerome Hopkins, representing self
- September Hopper, Environmental Defense Center
- Cara Horowitz, Attorney, NRDC
- David Howekamp, Consultant, California Coastal Protection Network
- Eugene Hubbard, representing self
- Tam Hunt, Director, Community Environmental Council
  
- Clarissa Job, representing self
- Susan Jordan, Director, California Coastal Protection Network
- Rachel Roderick Jones, presenting self
  
- Cheryl Karpowicz, Vice President, Ecology and Environment, Inc.
- Walt Keller, Ph.D., representing self
- Christine Kemp, Attorney for Owner, Ariach, LTD, property owner
- Heikki Ketola, President of Santa Monica Software
- Renee Klimczak, BHP Billiton
- Paul Kowalski, Tide Power organization
- Karen Kraus, Staff Attorney, Environmental Defense Center on behalf of California Coastal Protection Network
- Linda Krop, Chief Counsel, Environmental Defense Center on behalf of California Coastal Protection Network
- Carol Kurtz, Attorney, representing self
  
- Hank Lacayo, State President, Congress of California Seniors
- Danusia Larsen, representing self
- Ann Gist Levin, representing self
- Nancy L. Lindholm, President/CEO, Oxnard Chamber of Commerce
- Chung Liu, Deputy Executive Officer, South Coast Air Quality Management District
- Dr. Manuel M. Lopez, Former Mayor-City of Oxnard
- Loretta Lynch, UC Berkeley Executive Scholar, Pacific Environment
- Barbara Macri-Ortiz, Attorney

## **PUBLIC ADDRESSING THE LNG ITEM - CONTINUED**

- Alice Madrid, Migrant Statical Technician, Ocean View School District
- Matthew Margulies, M.D., representing self
- David Maron, CEO, Maron Computer Services
- Mark Massara, Director of Coastal Programs, Sierra Club
- John Mazza, Director, Malibu Township Council
- Mary McClenning, representing self
- Jim McComb, representing self
- Shannon McComb, representing self
- Bill Meeker, representing self
- James A. Merrill, representing self
- Jeremy Meyer, Director, Humanity's Team of Ventura County
- Deborah Meyer-Morris, President, Oxnard Council PTA
- Kathleen Misewitch, President/CEO, Port Hueneme Chamber of Commerce
- Maricela Morales, Mayor, Port Hueneme
- Bailey Morris, Student
- Craig Moyer, Manatt, Phelps and Phillips
- Trisha Munro, representing self
- Herlinda Murguia, representing self
  
- Jack Nicholl, American Lung Association
- George Niznik, representing self
  
- Denis O'Leary, Board Member, Oxnard School District
- Alison Ayers O'Neill, representing self
- Joseph O'Neill, Attorney at Law, representing self
  
- Fran Pavley, Assemblymember, (Ret.)
- Nancy Pedersen, representing self
- Maree Penhart, representing self
- Pat Perez, California Energy Board
- John Pinard, representing self
- Raymond Pinedo, Instructional Assistant, Santa Paula High
- Shiva Polefka, Environmental Defense Center
- Bill Powers, P.E., Mechanical Engineer, Ratepayers for Affordable Clean Energy
- Leslie Purcell, representing self

## **PUBLIC ADDRESSING THE LNG ITEM - CONTINUED**

- Carmen Ramirez, Vice President, CAUSE
- Irene Rauschenberger, representing self
- Anne Ready, Malibu beach homeowner
- Will Reed, President, Santa Barbara Hispanic Chamber of Commerce
- Tim Riley, Attorney at Law, representing self
- Christine Rogerson, President, Malibu Association of Realtors
- Gloria Roman, representing self
- Francisco Romero, Teacher
- Murray Rosenblum, Port Hueneme City Council Member
- Jean Rountree, The Beacon Foundation
  
- Alan Salazar, representing self
- Josie Salinas, representing self
- Al Sanders, Ormond Beach Observers
- Cynthia Scott, Deputy with Supervisor Zev Yaroslavsky
- Dennis Seider, Member, Board of Directors, Latigo Cove Homeowner's Civic Association
- Tony Skinner, Business Representative, TriCounties Building and Construction Trades
- Terri Smith, representing self
- Trevor Smith, Vice-Chair, Los Padres Chapter, Sierra Club
- Kenneth Smokoska, Chair, Energy/Climate Change, Sierra Club of California
- Natalie Soloway, Former President of MAR
- Dineane Sperske, representing self
- Larry Stein, representing self
- Andy Stern, City Council Member, City of Malibu
- Michael Stubblefield, Chair, Los Padres Chapter of Sierra Club
  
- Scott Tallal, President, Trancas Highlands HOA
- William Terry, representing self
- Jane M. Tohmach, representing self
- Jesus Torres, Field Representative, Assemblymember Pedro Nava
- Eileen Tracy, representing self
  
- Pamela Conley Ulich, Malibu City Councilmember

## **PUBLIC ADDRESSING THE LNG ITEM - CONTINUED**

- Stuart Waldman, Chief of Staff, Assemblymember Lloyd Levine
- Michael White, representing self
- Allan Widmeyer, representing self
- Celia Williams, Environmental Defense Center
- Innes Willox, Consul-General, Australian Consulate-General
- Damon Wing, Aide, Ventura County Supervisor Linda Parks
- Andrew Wolford, Riskology Incorporated
- Dean Wood, EVO Limo Company
- Tom Wood, Air Quality Consultant, BHP Billiton
- Donna Worley, representing self
  
- Jim Yarbrough, representing self
- Kathryn Yarnell, Realtor, Malibu Business Roundtable